10 September 2012
The Problem of Legitimacy

“Colonne de juillet”
(July Column)
Place de la Bastille
Paris (1840)
## French Regimes since 1792

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Period</th>
<th>Leader(s)</th>
<th>Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>First Republic, 1792-1804</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Directory, 1795-1799</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consulate, 1799-1804</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First Empire, 1804-1815</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First Restoration, 1814</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hundred Days, spring 1815</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Restored Monarchy, 1815-1830</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Louis XVIII, 1815-1824</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charles X, 1824-1830</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>July Monarchy, 1830-1848</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Louis Philippe, 1830-1848</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>provisional government; Second Republic, 1848-1851</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Second Empire, 1851-1870</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>provisional government, 1870-1875</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Third Republic, 1875-1940</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>French State (&quot;Vichy&quot;) in south; German occupation in north, 1940-1942</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>all of France governed by German military with collaboration of Vichy state, 1942-1944</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fourth Republic, 1947-1958</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>provisional government, 1944-1947</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fifth Republic, 1958-present</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**When is modern France?**
“Modern France” as a set of problems and conflicts arising from 1789-1815:

Who speaks for “the nation”? How can “the nation’s” voice be heard?

Tension between formal legal equality and very obvious social inequality.

What is the status of changes introduced during the Revolution, e.g.,
sale of *biens nationaux* (property formerly held by the Church);
abolition of slavery, 1794-1802
liberal divorce laws?

How to deal with the divisions in society (religion/republic; old aristocracy/
Napoleonic nobility; “terrorists”/”white terrorists”) left by 25 years
of conflict?

What constitutes political legitimacy?
Sources of authority under Old Regime, Revolution, and Empire

Louis XVIII (1814/1815-1824) and Charles X (1824-1830)—
Restoration of “legitimate” Bourbon monarchs

Louis Philippe and July Monarchy (1830-1848)—
Orléanism and the “bourgeois” King

Key Dates

1812-1814 “War of Sixth Coalition”—Britain, Russia, Prussia, and Austria defeat French Empire;
April 1814 Generals abandon Napoleon; he abdicates; sent to Elba; Louis XVIII restored
March-July 1815 “Hundred Days”; Napoleon defeated at Waterloo, June 18; exiled to St. Helena
June-July 1815 Second Restoration

1830 July Revolution (“three glorious days”) chases Charles X from throne; Louis Philippe swears to rule as “constitutional king” and doubles franchise
1832 Royalist uprising in Provence; workers uprising in Lyon
1834 September laws reintroduce censorship; limit association
1840 return of Napoleon’s remains to Paris
Feb. 1848 February Revolution; Louis Philippe flees; provisional government created
Old Regime: divine right of kings ("Louis, by the grace of God, King of France and Navarre…")

"God has given to every people its ruler, and Israel is manifestly reserved to Him." [Eccles.] He therefore governs all peoples and gives them their kings, although he governed Israel in a more intimate and obvious manner. It appears from all this that the person of the king is sacred, and that to attack him in any way is sacrilege. … There is something religious in the respect accorded to a prince. The service of God and the respect for kings are bound together. St. Peter unites these two duties when he says, "Fear God. Honor the king."… But kings, although their power comes from on high, as has been said, should not regard themselves as masters of that power to use it at their pleasure;… they must employ it with fear and self-restraint, as a thing coming from God and of which God will demand an account."

Bishop Bossuet, *Politics Derived from the Very Words of Holy Scripture* (1709).

Sources of political legitimacy: France before the Revolution
Constitutional Monarchy (1789-1792)

“sovereignty resides essentially in the nation”

King as “first servant of the people”
King vows to uphold the Constitution
First Republic, 1792-1799

Nation is sovereign;
right and duty to resist oppression;
“no one can rule innocently”

Sources of political legitimacy: France as a Republic
First Empire, 1804-1815

history (Rome, Charlemagne)
military victory
“merit”—careers open to talent

Jean A. D. Ingres, *Napoleon on his Imperial Throne* (1806)

Sources of political legitimacy: France as an Empire

Statue of Napoleon overlooking the courtyard of *les Invalides* (Disabled Veterans’ Home), Paris, France
Treaty of Vienna, 1814-1815

first time diplomats tried to create conditions for lasting peace (rather than simply settle current conflict)

alliance of autocratic rulers tried to prevent future revolutions

all with the goal of RESTORING Europe to how it had been in 1789

“The contracting parties, desirous to bury in entire oblivion the dissensions which have agitated Europe, declare and promise that no individual of whatever rank … in the countries hereby restored and ceded, shall be prosecuted, disturbed, or molested for his opinions” Art. 16, Treaty of Paris, May 1814.

Johann M. Voltz, “The Congress” (1815)
What lessons did Restoration statesmen draw from 1789-1815?

Spain: Inquisition re-established
Army and Navy not allowed to communicate

Habsburg Empire: serfdom re-introduced

Papal States: banned street lights, vaccination

France: active missionary work in many areas

Russia: slavophiles celebrate distinct “Slavic” culture (emperor/tsar, Orthodox Church, peasantry) and reject “degenerate” Western Europe

Jesuits welcomed across Europe
Restoration Europe: Turning back the Clocks?

What did they fear?
French military aggression
spread of “revolutionary ideas”

Results of their fears:
more conservative than their grandfathers
or grandmothers had been
French king forcibly restored
Prussia strengthened and the German
Confederation created

How Restoration statesmen thought about the past; what did this mean for the present?
Louis XVIII between forgetting and remembering

“All investigation into opinions and votes expressed before the Restoration is forbidden. Courts and citizens should both show complete disregard (oubli) for the past.”

court. art. 11 of the 1814 Constitutional Charter

M.J. Blondel, *France receiving the Constitution from Louis XVIII* (ceiling of the Louvre), 1827

The First Restoration: Louis XVIII as constitutional and medieval monarch
The “re-christianization” of France

- marriage and baptism
- biens nationaux
- “Voltaire’s fault, Rousseau’s fault”

1814 Charter
- art. 5 freedom of religion
- art. 6 Catholicism is state religion
- art. 8 freedom of press + opinion

Catholic revival and Bourbon legitimacy
Charles X and Bourbon Tradition

official coronation portrait of Charles X (1824)

Legitimacy: A Revival of Divine-Right Monarchy?

funeral statues of Louis XVI and Marie Antoinette, Basilica of St. Denis (1826-1827)
Louis Philippe and the July Monarchy

“We will try to remain in the center [juste milieu], equally far from the excesses of popular power as from the abuses of royal power.”—Louis Philippe, 1831

July Revolution
July 28-30, 1830

Honoré Daumier, “The Past—the Present—the Future” (1834)

Eugène Delacroix, Liberty Leading the People (1830)

French postage stamps, 1982

Legitimacy: King by Revolution.
The Tricolor Flag (supported by Louis Philippe)

F. X. Winterhalter, Louis Philippe the First, King of the French (1839)—shown with plans for Versailles Museum

Legitimacy: King by Revolution and by History.
Spirit of Liberty

“July’s Column”
Place de la Bastille, Paris
1840

1789 and 1830—a revolutionary tradition?
"Napoleon’s Funeral Procession" (1835) woodcut from Epinal (Vosges)

Louis Philippe: the past as history
Louis E. G. Isabey, *Return of Napoleon’s Remains* (1843)
Les Invalides [Veterans Hospital], Paris

Napoleon's Tomb (1840)
Criticism and Caricature

Honoré Daumier, “Gargantua” (1831).

Le Charivari announces the verdict against Philipon.

Charles Philipon, publisher of La Caricature and Le Charivari—sketch in defense at his trial.