Annotated Bibliography

Possible Contributions of Bias to the School to Prison Pipeline

Compiled by
Mariella Arredondo
Natasha Williams

The Equity Project at Indiana University
August 2012
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Implicit Bias ................................................................................................................................. 3

Race, Gender, & Sexual Orientation Bias In Schools .......................................................... 5

Teacher Rating Scales ............................................................................................................. 5

Classroom Observations ....................................................................................................... 7

Teacher-Student Interactions ............................................................................................... 8

Students’ Perspectives on Race, Ethnicity, Sexuality, and Schooling ........................ 10

Stereotypes ................................................................................................................................. 11

Microaggression ........................................................................................................................ 13

Selected Interventions for Bias Reduction ........................................................................ 15

In this article, two experiments were conducted to test the effect that providing individual racial identity in crime alerts has on racial group stereotypes. In Experiment 1, 33 White and Asian undergraduate participants visualized four fictional crime scenarios involving Black or White would-be criminals. Results of the implicit association test (IAT) revealed that participants demonstrated significantly more negative implicit stereotypes toward Blacks as a group. In Experiment 2, 90 undergraduate and community participants read a written description of a crime scene with a suspect who was either depicted as White or Black, then imagined the suspect. Participants who read about a Black criminal reported and revealed more anti-Black/pro-White stereotypes on the IAT measure than those who read about a White criminal.


The person–group discrimination discrepancy (PGDD) theory was tested in this study. The theory suggests that members of disadvantaged groups believe that other members of their social groups are discriminated against, but not themselves. Results of three experiments using both explicit (self-report) and implicit (IAT) measures of discrimination revealed that on explicit measures, women and African Americans reported more discrimination toward members of their group than themselves; however, self-discrimination was revealed much more on implicit measures. These measures were obtained by recording the response rates of participants as they witnessed the categorization of members of disadvantaged groups with attributes associated with being a victim of discrimination.


Studies investigated relationships among individual differences in implicit and explicit prejudice and rigidity in thinking. The first study focused on White Americans’ prejudice toward Black Americans, while the second assessed White Americans’ prejudice toward a cluster of social groups. An analysis of self-reported bias measures
and results from the Implicit Association Test found that those who hold negative attitudes toward one disadvantaged group also tend to hold negative attitudes toward other disadvantaged groups. These findings provide evidence of ethnocentrism and support a relationship between implicit and explicit bias and rigidity in thinking.


Three studies, conducted with first year White college students, explore the moderating role of motivations to respond without prejudice (e.g. internal and external) in expressions of explicit and implicit race bias as a way to reduce prejudice. In all three studies, the participants reported their explicit attitudes toward African Americans. Explicit race bias was moderated by internal motivation to respond without prejudice, while implicit race bias was moderated by the interaction of internal and external motivation to respond without prejudice. Results indicated that participants that were rated as having high internal, low external responses exhibited lower levels of implicit race bias than did all other participants. Findings suggest that people who regulate their prejudice for primarily internal reasons are more successful than others in responding without prejudice.


In a series of laboratory studies in which participants were primed with a broad range of Black faces and White faces, the authors demonstrate that U.S. citizens implicitly associate Blacks and apes. Through a series of tasks and questionnaires, the authors reveal a strong bidirectional association between Blacks and apes that directs visual perception and attention, but found that this association may not be due to personalized, implicit attitudes. Even after controlling for implicit anti-Black bias, the implicit association between Blacks and apes can lead to greater endorsement of violence against a Black suspect than against a White suspect. The authors also demonstrated that subtle media representations of Blacks as apelike are associated with jury decisions to execute Black defendants.
TEACHER RATING SCALES


This study explored teacher perceptions and prejudices with regard to race. On a “piles task” in which teachers were required to place students’ photographs in piles representative of positive to negative ratings of the child, the results indicated that overall, Hispanic teachers provided more negative ratings of students than White and Black teachers. White and Black teachers placed more White students in a relatively positive position, while Hispanic teachers placed more Black students in a relatively positive position and Hispanic students in a negative position.


This study examines teacher-student racial matching efforts by comparing the effects of matching across different stages of schooling. Two data sets were used for this comparison: the Early Childhood Longitudinal Study-Kindergarten Class of 1998-99, and the National Education Longitudinal Study (NELS) of eight graders from 1988. Ordinary least squares regression analyses indicate that, in general, teachers rated Black students as poorer classroom citizens exhibiting more problem behaviors (i.e. argumentative, involved in fights, exhibiting anger) and exhibiting fewer approaches to learning (i.e. ability to be attentive, persistent with tasks, display of eagerness to learn) compared to white students in both kindergarten and eighth grade. Student-teacher racial interactions from the kindergarten sample suggest that Black students were rated by Black teachers as exhibiting fewer problems than White students who were rated by White teachers. Among eighth graders, Black students received more favorable evaluations from Black teachers than from White teachers in terms of their approach to learning.

Examines the effects of teacher race, pupil race, and teacher–pupil racial congruence on teacher ratings of school adjustment of grades K-5. Results of the teacher-pupil rating scale measuring school problem behaviors indicated that African American children were judged by both African American and White teachers to have more serious school adjustment problems, fewer competencies, more stereotypically negative qualities, and poorer future educational prognoses than White children. African American teachers, compared to White teachers, rated all children as having more competencies and fewer problems, and had more positive academic expectations for all children.


In a meta-analysis of over 30 studies examining student talent, effort, academic ability, grade point average, and adjustment, the researchers found that teachers had more positive expectations for White students than for students of color. Teacher ratings revealed that teacher expectations, academic, social, or performance on both, were rated lower for African American and Latino students than White students, whereas Asian Americans were viewed more favorably. Additionally, teachers made more disciplinary referrals for students of color than for White students.


This longitudinal study, using a sample of middle school adolescents and their teachers, assessed whether teacher ratings of student behavior problems varied according to teacher-student racial-ethnic differences and students' perception of teachers' attitudes toward them. Questionnaire data from students, parent ratings on the Child Behavior Checklist (CBCL) and teacher ratings on the Teacher Report Form (TFR) revealed that African American students rated by Hispanic and White teachers had significantly higher mean total behavior problem scores than African American students rated by African American teachers. Teacher ratings compared to parents’ ratings indicated that African American students received higher behavior problem scores by teachers than parents.
CLASSROOM OBSERVATIONS


This article is a year-long ethnographic study of two kindergarten boys (one black and one white) in the same class at a magnet school. Both boys were referred for counseling services for exhibiting similar behavioral difficulties in the classroom. After putting a number of services in place for both students, the teacher later referred the Black student for special education placement in a learning adjustment setting for emotionally disturbed students. Results of the teacher interview indicated that she used different explanations to account for similar disruptive behaviors expressed by both students. While the failure of the White student was attributed to external factors, such as hostility toward his father and teacher's behavior, internal attributions, such as lack of inner controls needed to suppress aggressive impulses, were used to account for the behavior of the Black student. The author suggests that because the teacher perceived the students differently, she behaved differently toward them.


This study examined teachers' verbal and nonverbal comportment in the classroom to assess differences based on sex of the child, race of the child, and race of the teacher. With a sample of 16 female first grade teachers in an urban public elementary school system, observations of verbal and nonverbal behavior revealed that boys received more positive and negative teacher behaviors on both verbal and nonverbal levels. Moreover, White teachers directed more nonverbal criticism (rejection of work, ideas, vocal sarcasm, anger or annoyance) toward black males.


This ethnographic and discursive study examined school suspensions in a high school with a predominately Hispanic and African American student population by looking at the sociocultural factors that influence a teacher’s decision to remove a student from the classroom. The analysis of qualitative data (i.e. classroom observations, videotaped lessons, field notes taken by researchers, and interviews conducted with teachers,
administrators, safety personnel, and students) shows that suspensions frequently occurred not as a result of physical violence but most often from nonviolent discourse or interactions among students and teachers where teachers felt the students of color were undermining his/her authority. These results show the subjective nature of a teacher’s decision to remove a student from the classroom.

**TEACHER-STUDENT INTERACTIONS**


Analyzing 6,988 children in 381 classrooms in 21 elementary schools implementing School-Wide Positive Behavioral Interventions and Supports (SWPBIS), this randomized trial study aimed to identify factors at the student and classroom levels that were contributing to the overrepresentation of African American students in office disciplinary referrals. Bradshaw et al. (2010) found that African American students were significantly more likely than White students to receive in-office disciplinary referrals even after controlling for the student’s level of teacher-rated behavior problems, teacher ethnicity, and other classroom factors. Results also suggested that ethnic match between students and their teachers did not reduce the risk for referrals among African American students.


In order to examine whether teacher-student interactions continue to be racially biased in integrated classrooms, Casteel conducted a study with 417 seventh grade students attending eight racially integrated schools in a district in southern Louisiana. Observations of classroom instruction led by Caucasian female teachers revealed that African American students are not treated as positively as Caucasian students. According to nearly all 16 dependent variables of a modified version of the Brophy-Good Dyadic Coding System, teachers interacted more favorably with Caucasian students. African American students were not praised as much, given as much positive feedback, or provided clues to help answer question as were Caucasian students. Relative to all students, Caucasian American boys received the most favorable treatment and initiated the most student-teacher contact. On the contrary, African American boys received the least favorable treatment from their teachers.

A quantitative literature synthesis of 15 studies indicates that African-American/Latino students receive more negative feedback and less positive reinforcement from teachers in the classroom. Additionally, teachers were found to interact less frequently with students of color than Euro-American students in the classroom. A variance centered form of meta-analysis and coding was used based on three types of interactional assessments - negative, positive, and quantity (i.e. amount of times teachers interacted with student). The results indicate a source of differential treatment in the classroom by teachers that may impact student achievement.


Examines teachers’ theories about why students are disciplined in the context of a large urban high school with a racially and culturally diverse student population, but with large overrepresentation of African American males in the disciplinary system. Five dominant theories were captured on why students have discipline problems, which pointed to the individual student and the school as sources of the problem. The racialized nature of the discipline gap was not acknowledged. When race was mentioned, it was in the context of the deficit theory, with factors related to poverty as sources of the discipline problems in African American students. The study introduces a Culturally Relevant Discipline framework that takes into consideration the school, community, and society to influence culturally relevant intervention approaches. These need to take into account race and culture and understand the origins of the discipline problem as multifaceted.


This study examines the link between peer-rating of behavior and social status with teacher and administrator-enforced discipline decisions, context, and demographic characteristics as predictors of teacher and administrator decisions about discipline. Data for the analysis consisted of a sample of 1493 elementary school students. Exploratory results using classification tree analysis indicated that even after accounting
for peer ratings as aggressive or prosocial, being African-American was among the most significant predictors of serious disciplinary action.


Drawing on data from the second and third wave of the National Educational Longitudinal Study (NELS) 1988 of students in the 10th and 12th grade, this study assesses whether the impact of teacher’s perceptions on performance, measured by teacher expectations of whether students will attend college and teacher assessments of students’ diligence in completing homework assignments and behavior, hinges on whether the teacher is White or African American. Using multi-population LISERAL models, Oates (2003) found evidence of an anti-black bias among white teachers and race neutrality among African-American teachers. African American students appeared especially vulnerable to negative perceptions when taught by White teachers.

**STUDENTS’ PERSPECTIVES ON RACE, ETHNICITY, SEXUALITY, AND SCHOOLING**


Using a diverse sample consisting of mostly Latino and African American elementary, middle, and high school students from six inner city schools in California, this study examined attitudes toward teacher ethnicity, bilingualism, and gender. Using mean student ratings of 12 hypothetical teachers, an ANOVA analysis revealed that students had the most positive attitudes toward African American, bilingual, and female teachers. Evidence was found of student preference for same ethnicity teachers but not for same gender teachers.


In this article the author studies racial labeling practices of young high school students’ everyday talk in a California school. In her analysis, Pollock observes that young people who identified as being of mixed races challenged the idea of using simple racial categories (i.e. black, white, brown, etc.) to describe the complexities of one’s race; however, students employed simple racial identification categories daily, much like the adults around them, to describe and analyze social orders and inequalities in resources, like obtaining materials and other curricular resources.

This article tests for the socialization of homophobic attitudes and behavior within adolescent peer groups using a sample of 213 students in grade 7 through 11 attending a rural, Midwest public high school. Surveys including homophobic attitudes and behaviors were completed at the start of the spring semester and then again eight months later. Multilevel models indicated that even after controlling for the predictive effect of individuals’ own previously reported attitudes and behavior, group level attitudes and behavior at the first time point predicted homophobic attitudes and behavior within the peer group 8 months later, suggesting that peers influence an individuals’ own homophobic attitudes and behaviors over time.


This study offers an exploratory analysis, disaggregated by race, of how students perceive the fairness of the discipline administered by their teachers and whether they feel connected to any teachers in their school. Survey data, drawn from all eleventh graders in ten high schools in Seattle, suggest that African Americans, Latinos and members of other racial and ethnic groups perceive more differences in teacher fairness in administering punishment than White and Asian students. However, these findings did not correlate with either the overall suspension rate in the school or racial disparities within these rates. Possible explanations for the discrepancy include the selection bias of the respondents and the influence of the school’s climate on students’ responses. Finally, the authors point to the experiences of Latinos and Asians as warranting more attention with regard to school discipline and attachment to school and teachers. This is particularly important for the Latino population, which is experiencing higher dropout rates and higher rates of segregation in schools.

**STEREOTYPES**

Four studies investigated the role that stereotype threat plays in producing racial distancing behavior in an anticipated conversation paradigm. It was hypothesized that the threat of appearing racist may have the effect of causing Whites to distance themselves from Blacks during conversations. ANCOVA analyses revealed that when White participants were expected to discuss a racially contentious topic with Black partners, the threat of appearing racist caused them to physically distance themselves from those partners. Both stereotype activation and stereotype-threat relevant thoughts were positively related to distance, such that the more White participants thought about the stereotype, the farther away they moved. However, neither implicit nor explicit measures of prejudice predicted this pattern of distancing, and no measure of prejudice moderated the role of stereotype threat on distance.


Graham and Lowery (2004) conducted an analogous experimental study with an ethnically diverse sample of 105 active police and probation officers. They found that, compared with officers who were subliminally primed with neutral, non-race-related words, officers who had been subliminally primed with words related to the category Black were more likely to recommend harsher punishments for hypothetical adolescents who had committed crimes, as presented in standardized written vignettes.


Using a general theory of domain identification as a theoretical framework to describe achievement barriers faced by women in advanced quantitative areas and African Americans in school, Steele offers recommendations for policy and “wise” schooling interventions for practice. Based on wise strategies, the author and colleagues, implemented a program for incoming freshman students at the undergraduate level with an oversampling of 20% Black students and 20% non-Black students of color. The program was presented as a transition program aimed at helping students maximize university life. Analysis of first-semester grades averaged over the first two years of the project showed promising results. African American students in the program, as opposed to African American students in remedial programs or not in a program, showed higher grade performance and high retention rates in general.

The study tested whether stereotype threat can undermine the acquisition of academic knowledge and thus harm performance even in nonthreatening settings. In experiment 1, 32 Black and 44 White students studied rare words in either nonthreatening or threatening conditions. An ANCOVA analysis of recall of words and matching the definition with the word revealed that Black students performed worse on the test than on the warm-up. Results also revealed that Black students who studied in the threatening rather than nonthreatening environment performed worse. Experiment 2 measured the effect of eliminating the learning-threat effect with a value affirmation in a sample of 36 Black undergraduates. Black students who had been affirmed in a threatening condition performed better on the test than Blacks who were not affirmed, suggesting that stereotype threat can undermine both learning and performance.


Using a meta-analysis of laboratory studies, the authors tested whether stereotyped students would perform better than non-stereotyped students in conditions that reduce stereotype threat. Results suggest that under conditions that reduce threat, stereotyped students performed better than non-stereotyped students who had the same level of prior past performance. The meta-analyses revealed a bias in standard measures of academic performance large enough to account for a meaningful proportion of group differences on high-stakes tests.

**MICROAGGRESSION**


Using critical race theory perspective as a theoretical framework (CRT) for this study, Howard (2008) interviewed ten African American middle and high school males, from urban and suburban schools, in attempt to allow them to shed light on their experiences in schools. Qualitative data revealed an awareness of widely held negative racial stereotypes about African American men, the belief that race was frequently a factor in their interactions with teachers and school administrators, and accounts of experiences of discrimination and racism in their schools.

This study examined the mispronunciation or changing of students’ names as a form of racial microaggression in K-12 classrooms. The researchers explored the narratives of students of color to develop an understanding of the internalized racial microaggressions they experienced and the implications of sustained exposure to these microaggressions. Using a Critical Race Theory framework, the authors discussed the mispronunciation of names within the context of structural racism in schools, and highlighted the disrespect, cultural devaluing, and internalized sense of inferiority associated with a teacher’s inability and unwillingness to learn and pronounce unfamiliar names. They concluded that educators must be aware of the Eurocentric bias in classrooms, identify and expand their cultural limits, and recognize the influence they have on a student’s sense of self in order to reduce the long-term effects of cultural undermining in the school system.


This article describes microaggressions and the implication for people of color. Racial microaggressions are described as difficult to identify. According to the authors, are brief and conventional in daily verbal, behavioral, or environmental indignities, whether intentional or unintentional, and they communicate aggressive, offensive, or negative racial insults toward people of color. Perpetrators of microaggressions are often unaware that they engage in such communications when they interact with racial/ethnic minorities. Moreover, racial microaggressions are suggested as seeming to appear in three forms - microassault, microinsult, and microinvalidation. Future research is requested to point to adaptive ways of handling microaggressions for people of color and to develop suggestions on how to increase awareness of microaggressions in White people in order to alter their behavior.

**SELECTED INTERVENTIONS FOR BIAS REDUCTION**


Provides an account of how a South African White high school principal and teacher perceive certain groups of students’ commitments, abilities, and motivations based on
their dress, speech, and other cultural expressions that diverge from middle-class white norms. Carter suggests that teachers should not make judgments about the capacities of students based on non-cognitive traits, but should seek to help students navigate back and forth across different cultural and stylistic codes, adapting their behaviors as the situation demands. Furthermore, educators must learn to cultivate their own multicultural navigational skills to model for students how people effectively negotiate meaning among cultures. This is accomplished by respecting multiple cultural identities, engaging in pedagogic practices that expand students’ worldviews, increasing cultural capital, and instilling students with pride in their multicultural identity.


This article describes a multi-faceted prejudice breaking intervention developed to reduce implicit bias long term. The article examines the impact of the intervention on the extent of implicit race bias assessed over time. The intervention is based on the premise that implicit bias functions like a habit that can be broken through a combination of awareness of implicit bias, concern about the effects of that bias, and the application of strategies to reduce bias. The effectiveness of the intervention was evaluated using a randomized, controlled design where 91 non-Black students completed a 12 week study for course credit. Results of the evaluation demonstrated that people who received the intervention showed great reductions in implicit race bias. Additionally, the intervention was found to increase both personal awareness of one’s bias and a general concern about discrimination in society. Participants in the control group did not show any of the above effects.


Offers three suggestions to educators for talking more precisely about which acts help equalize opportunity for students of color and what offering equal opportunity in the school actually entails. The first suggestion is that educators discern which everyday acts move specific students or student populations toward educational opportunities and which acts move students farther away from it. The second suggestion is the need to identify and address the needs of specific subpopulations in their schools. The third suggestion requests educators to color their “colormuteness” by talking precisely about
the causes of racial disparities, as well as discussing opportunities students would need if disparities are eliminated.


Suggests the need for candid, courageous conversations about race so that educators may understand why performance inequity persists, and learn how they can develop a curriculum that promotes true academic equity. The authors’ present a system wide plan for transforming schools and districts that includes 1) Implementation exercises 2) Prompts, language, and tools that support profound discussion 3) Activities and checklists for administrators and 4) Action steps for creating an equity team.