Discipline Disparities:

A Research-to-Practice Collaborative

Annotated Bibliography

Closing the School Discipline Gap

(Organized by Content Area)

Compiled by

Natasha Williams

Mariella Arredondo

The Equity Project at Indiana University

January 2013

STATE AND FEDERAL EDUCATIONAL POLICY

1. What are the implications of the conference presentations for recommendations for policy change that would reduce disproportionality in school exclusion?

2. What in the new or existing research would be most persuasive to policymakers? How might that be translated and transmitted effectively?

3. What additional research is needed that would address policymakers' concerns about exclusionary discipline?

I. **State and Federal Educational Policy**

Balfanz, R., Byrnes, V., & Fox, J. (2012). Sent home and put off-track: The antecedents, disproportionalities, and consequences of being suspended in the ninth grade. Unpublished manuscript. Center for Civil Rights Remedies national conference: *Closing the School Research Gap: Research to Remedies.*

This longitudinal study analyzes data for a cohort of 181,897 Florida state students who were first time 9th graders in the 2000-01 school year and follows them through high school and their post-secondary outcomes. Analysis of 9th grade suspension data finds that black students, students who are economically disadvantaged, and special education students are three demographic subgroups that are disproportionately suspended, both in the frequency of suspensions and the duration in number of school days lost. Further analyses show that out-of-school suspensions in the 9th grade year are also significantly and negatively correlated to later high school graduation as well as post-secondary enrollment and persistence. Closer analysis shows that disciplinary incidents are interrelated with other of indicators of student disengagement from school, such as course failures and absenteeism. Policies seeking to address these issues cannot focus on reducing suspensions alone, but must also address student attendance and course passing in a comprehensive and systematic manner.

Brown, L. H., & Beckett, K. S. (2006). The role of the school district in student discipline: Building consensus in Cincinnati. *The Urban Review, 38*(3), 235-256.

The purpose of this article is to demonstrate how the process of developing and implementing a district-wide code of student behavior in Cincinnati Public Schools (CPS) played an important role in reducing disruptive behaviors leading to student suspension and expulsion. CPS involved stakeholders (i.e. teachers, administrators, parents, and community members) during the development of its code of student conduct policy, responding to the concerns of all stakeholders in the range of programs it offered, and requiring that consensus be reached before recommendations could be made. The authors argue that school districts can play a leadership role in reducing levels of problem behavior by initiating a community-wide process to build consensus on a set of disciplinary policies that are consistently enforced throughout a district and on a range of disciplinary programs that respond to the needs of individual schools.

Fenning, P., Pulaski, S., Gomez, M., Morello, M., Maciel, L., Maroney, E., et al. (2012). Call to action: A critical need for designing alternatives to suspension and expulsion. *Journal of School Violence, 11*(2), 105–117.

This study analyzes written discipline policies in 120 high schools from six different states. Using discipline codes rating form–revised in the analysis, the authors found that discipline policies varied by state in terms of the degree to which suspension was used, however, suspension was commonly offered as a response for all behaviors, including minor ones. Based on these findings and related literature, the authors make a call to action in order to 1) address

the long-standing punitive nature of school discipline to include alternatives to punitive discipline and 2) focus on revising discipline policies to align with a prevention-oriented view of discipline.

Irby, D. J. (2012). Net-deepening of school discipline. *The Urban Review***, 1-23.**

Irby conducted an ethnographic content analysis of 15 chronological district-wide codes of student conduct from the School District of Philadelphia to investigate how policies change over time. Corrective actions changed in three common ways that made the discipline policy more severe; (1) corrective action additions(s), (2) corrective action and violation level eliminations, and (3) reordering the rank of corrective actions. Findings suggest the possibility that school organizations have, over time, shifted toward school discipline frameworks that get students into deeper trouble today than in years past and make severe punishment increasingly likely. The author offers educators, policy-makers, and researchers conceptual and analytical considerations for developing proactive restorative discipline policies that meet the educational needs of all students.

Losen, D. J. (2011). *Discipline policies, successful schools, and racial justice***. National Education Policy Center. Retrieved November 26, 2012 from** http://nepc.colorado.edu/publication/discipline-policies

This policy brief reviews racial disparities in school discipline, including trends over time, how these disparities break down along lines of gender and disability status, and documents how removing students from classrooms for minor disciplinary issues harms overall achievement goals and does not improve education for the remaining students. Losen provides recommendations based on the research reviewed to improve policies and practices that will help safeguard the civil rights of students and create more effective and equitable learning environments.

Marchbanks, M. P., Blake, J. J., Booth, E. A., Carmichael, D., Seibert, A. L., Fabelo, T., et al. (2012). The economic effects of exclusionary discipline on grade retention and high school dropout. Unpublished manuscript. Center for Civil Rights Remedies national conference: *Closing the School Research Gap: Research to Remedies***.**

Nearly 15% of students are disciplined in a given year, with 60% of students being disciplined at-least once between grades 7 through 12. The academic outcomes of exclusionary discipline are understudied and the economic effects are e not fully known. The study examines the effects of school discipline contact on students' risk for grade retention and school dropout using a statewide sample of 7th grade students tracked through their 12th grade year. Results indicate that school discipline accounts for approximately 4,700 grade retentions per year in the state of Texas. The late entry into the workforce caused by grade retention has an effect of over $68 million, including $5.6 million in lost tax revenue. Further, the additional year of instruction costs the state nearly $41 million dollars. For each year an individual student is retained the

effect on the net social surplus exceeds $23,000. Results also indicate that school discipline relates to a 29% increase in high school dropout. These additional dropouts account for an economic effect of $711 million per year.

Pfleger, R. & Wiley, K. (2012). *Colorado Disciplinary Practices, 2008-2010: Disciplinary Actions, Student Behaviors, Race, and Gender.* **Boulder, CO: National Education Policy Center. Retrieved November 26, 2012 from** http://nepc.colorado.edu/publication/colorado-disciplinary-practices**.**

The report provides an analysis of the nature of disproportionality in Colorado. Report findings indicate that over a two year school period discretionary behavior categories, that include disobedience, detrimental behaviors, and "other" violations, account for 85.5% of student behavioral incidents. Schools, on average, are more likely to assign out-of-school suspensions than any other disciplinary action; additionally, higher percentages of African American, American Indian, and Latino students receive disciplinary actions compared with White and Asian American students. African Americans and other students of color are assigned out-of-school suspensions at rates far higher than White or Asian students. Two important issues arise from this data that can have important policy implications; 1) It is important to ask whether racial disproportionality reflect a disproportionate number of students of color engaging in certain types of behaviors, or does it reflect students of color being punished for behaviors that White students engage in without receiving serious consequences; 2) It is necessary to highlight the detrimental effects of out-of-school suspensions and the negative consequences associated with that form of punishment, such as higher dropout rates.

Robinson, J. P., & Espelage, D. L. (2012). Bullying explains only part of LGBTQ–heterosexual risk disparities implications for policy and practice. *Educational Researcher*, *41***(8), 309-319.**

In this article, the authors investigate the extent to which this difference in rates of victimization can explain LGBTQ youths' greater rates of suicidal ideation, suicide attempts, and unexcused absences from school. The sample consisted of 11,337 students in Grades 7 through 12 from 30 schools in Dane County, Wisconsin. Findings indicate that, LGBTQ-identified students were 3.3 times as likely to think about suicide ($p < .0001$), 3.0 times as likely to attempt suicide ($p = .007$), and 1.4 times as likely to skip school ($p = .047$). This pattern of findings suggests that policies aimed simply at reducing bullying may not be effective in bringing LGBTQ youth to the level of their heterosexual peers in terms of psychological and educational outcomes. Additional policies may be needed to promote safe, supportive school environments.

Toldson, I. A., McGee, T., & Lemmons, B. P. (2012). Reducing suspensions by improving academic engagement among school-age black males. Unpublished manuscript. Center for Civil Rights Remedies national conference: *Closing the School Research Gap: Research to Remedies***.**

This chapter addresses the excessive use of suspensions and other disciplinary actions against Black males who are disengaged from school. Academically disengaged students often come to school late, miss assignments, have difficulty understanding schoolwork, and may have attention challenges or alternative learning styles. Research suggests that academically disengaged students account for the majority of all suspensions. This study examines responses of students, parents and teachers who completed the survey *Monitoring the Future: A Continuing Study of American Youth.* The chapter clarifies the relationship between suspensions and academic disengagement, and provides policy solutions for school leaders to develop strategies to reduce suspensions by providing a more inclusive and compassionate learning environment for Black males.

Vanderhaar, J. E., Petrosko, J. M., & Munoz, M. A. (2012). A longitudinal investigation of disciplinary alternative school placement predictors, the risk of subsequent juvenile detention; and racial disparities in a cohort of elementary children. Unpublished manuscript. Center for Civil Rights Remedies national conference: *Closing the School Research Gap: Research to Remedies***.**

This longitudinal investigation of multiple predictors of student placement in disciplinary alternative schools within a large school district identifies the risk of subsequent involvement in the juvenile justice system. Results reveal that students suspended three or more times are 25.6 times more likely to be placed in a disciplinary alternative school. Of those placed in alternative school during elementary, half experience-subsequent juvenile detention before the end of 12th grade. African-American males are disproportionately represented among those experiencing subsequent detention illuminating the salience of race in the school -to alternative school -to juvenile detention pipeline in elementary school. In the era of high stakes "data driven decision making" it is imperative that school discipline data be used to make sound policy and practice decisions by district leaders. School districts are well positioned to use the wealth of data collected that pinpoint early warning indicators and resulting outcomes of students that are subjected to the exclusionary discipline policies they enact, and alter policies and practices known to be detrimental to the most vulnerable children they serve.

SCHOOL-TO-JUVENILE JUSTICE SYSTEMS & PROCESSES

1. What does the research tell us about needed changes within policing and referral practices within schools?

2. What should those representing juvenile justice system actors be doing to reduce school referrals?

3. What research gaps still need to be filled, to inform better policy and practice between schools and juvenile justice systems?

II. School-to-Juvenile Justice Systems & Processes

Booker, K., & Mitchell, A. (2011). Patterns in recidivism and discretionary placement in disciplinary alternative education: The impact of gender, ethnicity, age, and special education status. *Education and Treatment of Children*, *34*(2), 193-208.

This study examined the probability of (a) being placed in a disciplinary alternative education setting for mandatory versus discretionary reasons and (b) returning to placement within the same year among an ethnically diverse sample (African American, Caucasian, Hispanic) of middle and high school students (N=270). Participants were compared based on ethnicity, gender, grade level, and special education status. Students of color were significantly more likely than Caucasian students to be placed in disciplinary alternative education for discretionary reasons (i.e.truancy, drugs, gang involvement) and were more likely to return to placement within the same school year. A similar result was revealed for high school students when compared to middle school students. No differences were found for discretionary placement between boys and girls, but boys were 2.3 times more likely to be recidivists.

Christle, C. A., Jolivette, K., & Nelson, C. M. (2005). Breaking the school to prison pipeline: Identifying school risk and protective factors for youth delinquency. *Exceptionality*, *13*(2), 69-88.

This article includes three multi-method studies that examine three school characteristics related to delinquency—academic failure, suspension, and dropout—at the elementary, middle, and high school levels. Schools that were high performing were compared with low performing with respect to each of these characteristics. Results suggest that school-level characteristics can help minimize the risks for youth delinquency. The majority of court-involved youth have experienced academic failure, suspension, and dropout. Findings suggest that such school-level characteristics as supportive leadership, dedicated and collegial staff, school-wide behavior management, and effective academic instruction can help minimize the risks for youth delinquency.

Gonsoulin, S., Zablocki, M., & Leone, P. E. (2012). Safe schools, staff development, and the school to prison pipeline. *Teacher Education and Special Education: The Journal of the Teacher Education Division of the Council for Exceptional Children*, *34*(4), 309-319.

New approaches to staff development that create positive school communities are essential in stemming the "school-to-prison pipeline." Changing school culture to a system that supports youth development and minimizes the use of punitive, ineffective responses to behavior problems is a challenge. Staff development that involves the school and larger community in a three-tiered staff development system, however, can play an essential role in the transformation of the school. The authors review best practices in staff development in the context of changing school management and discipline practices, and recommend alternatives to ways in which schools respond to chronic and serious violations of the school behavioral code.

Kupchik, A., & Catlaw, T.J. (2012). Discipline and Participation: The Long-Term Effects of Suspension and School Security on the Political and Civic Engagement of Youth. Unpublished manuscript. Center for Civil Rights Remedies national conference: *Closing the School Research Gap: Research to Remedies***.**

This study uses the National Longitudinal Survey of Adolescent Health (Add Health) dataset to evaluate the long-term influence of school discipline and security on political and civic participation. This study finds that young adults with a history of suspension in school are less likely than others to vote and volunteer in civic activities after high school, suggesting that suspension negatively impacts the overall likelihood that youth will engage in future political and civic activities. Results suggest that the intensity of the effect of suspension is consistent across racial/ethnic groups. Overall, these findings are consistent with the theoretical and normative literatures that point to the potentially long-term negative implications of punitive disciplinary policies and the salient role schools play in preparing youth to participate in a democratic polity as adults. It is concluded that suspension, in particular, is anti-democratic insofar in that it substitutes the exclusion and physical removal of students for dialogue and collaborative problem-‐-‐-‐solving.

Osher, D., Coggshall, J., Colombi, G., Woodruff, D., Francois, S., & Osher, T. (2012). Building school and teacher capacity to eliminate the school-to-prison pipeline. *Teacher Education and Special Education: The Journal of the Teacher Education Division of the Council for Exceptional Children***, 35(4), 284-295.**

In this article, the authors first examine four factors that amplify the pipeline to prison, which if addressed effectively by educators can reduce it while creating alternative pathways to success. These four factors are (a) racial disparities, (b) poor conditions for learning, (c) family–school disconnection, and (d) the failure to build the social and emotional capacity of youth. The authors provide concrete suggestions for bolstering educator and school capacity to eliminate the school to prison pipeline and implications for teacher preparation.

Theriot, M. (2009). School resource officers and the criminalization of student behavior. *Journal of Criminal Justice, 37***, 280-287.**

In a three year study of 13 schools with an SRO and 15 schools without in a Southeastern school district with both urban and suburban characteristics, Theriot evaluated the impact of SROs on school-based arrest rates by comparing arrest at the thirteen schools with an SRO to the fifteen schools without and SRO in the same district. Schools that had SROs had nearly five times the number of arrests for disorderly conduct as schools without an SRO even when controlling for the school's level of economic disadvantage. However, when controlling for school poverty, schools with an SRO had fewer arrests for weapons and assault charges.

Sanchez, J. E., Yoxsimer, A., & Hill, G. C. (2012). Uniforms in the middle school: Student opinions, discipline data, and school police data. *Journal of School Violence*, *11*(4), 345-356.

This study investigated public middle school students' opinions on the benefits of wearing a school uniform. A review of related literature is provided along with results of the opinions obtained from 604 seventh- and eighth-grade middle school students attending a public school in Nevada that had recently initiated a school uniform policy. Improvements in discipline data and school police data were also examined. Results highlighted the perceived benefits (i.e., decreases in discipline, gang involvement, and bullying and increases in safety, ease of going to school, confidence, and self-esteem) of wearing a uniform to school, as reported by students through a survey instrument. The results focus on gender, grade level, and racial/ethnic differences in students' responses.

Shollenberger, T.L. (2012). Racial disparities in school suspension and subsequent outcomes: evidence from the national longitudinal survey of youth 1997. Unpublished manuscript. Center for Civil Rights Remedies national conference: *Closing the School Research Gap: Research to Remedies.*

Using NLSY97 data, the author examined the prevalence and intensity of suspension among nationally representative samples of white, black, and Hispanic youth attending secondary school during the late 1990's. Suspension was a common experience, affecting more than one in three youth for a typical total of five days during K-12. Consistent with prior research, Black boys experiences the highest rates of suspension. They were also suspended earlier and more intensely than other youth, with nearly one in five suspended from school for a full month or more. Following youth into early adulthood reveals a strong correlation between suspension and negative outcomes in education and criminal justice. Among boys suspended for 10 total days or more, less than half had obtained a high school diploma by their mid-20s; more than one in four had been arrested; and three in ten had been sentenced to confinement in a juvenile or adult correctional facility. Substantial shares of suspended youth—including roughly half of suspended Hispanic boys—had not engaged in property crime, drug sales, or violent activity by the time they were first suspended from school. Thus, for these youth, any involvement in delinquency or crime that led to future arrest or incarceration began only after their careers of punishment. Taken together, these findings suggest the possibility of a causal relationship between suspension and subsequent outcomes.

Walker, B. L. T. (2012). Teacher education and African American males deconstructing pathways from the schoolhouse to the "big house". *Teacher Education and Special Education: The Journal of the Teacher Education Division of the Council for Exceptional Children*, *35*(4), 320-332.

In this study, the author focuses on the exclusionary school and societal practices that route American males from schools to juvenile detention and adult prisons. Findings are reported

from focus groups conducted with African American male adolescents who dropped out of school and were adjudicated. The disproportionate confinement of African American males in secure juvenile detention mirrors their experiences with school discipline. Given the potential influence of teacher and leadership preparation programs on pre- and in-service teacher and school practices, the study urges teacher educators to deconstruct and reverse pathways from the schoolhouse to the "Big House" and the need to explicitly prepare school personnel to understand and address the complex factors that shuttle African American males from schools and into juvenile justice and adult correctional systems.

DATA REPORTING, USE & ACCOUNTABILITY MECHANISMS

1. What data on disciplinary disparities should be reported and publicly available?

2. What are policy changes that could be made to increase data collection and availability?

3. What accountability mechanisms should be embedded, and where, to encourage accountability on issues of school discipline disparities (e.g. triggers in NCLB)?

4. What additional research protocols or requirements are needed to provide needed data? (e.g. school climate surveys, data on LGBT suspensions). Who might ideally develop these?

III. Data Reporting, Use, & Accountability Mechanism

Booth, E. A., Marchbanks III, M. P., Carmichael, D., & Fabelo, T. (2012). Comparing campus discipline rates: A multivariate approach for identifying schools with significantly different than expected exclusionary discipline rates. *Journal of Applied Research on Children: Informing Policy for Children at Risk,* **3(2), 6.**

This article uses a multivariate model to analyze a longitudinal, statewide dataset for all secondary students in Texas from 2000 to 2008 in order to examine how campus discipline rates differ across schools with statistically similar students, teachers, and campus characteristics. Results suggest that despite differences in the resources and challenges across districts and campuses, there is substantial variation in the rates at which campuses choose to discipline students. The findings are important for understanding that some schools with similar characteristics have significantly different exclusionary discipline rates, and they are important for informing policy and agency level decision-making. Policymakers, education agencies, and school district personnel can use this methodology and these data to identify campuses where the extant campus behavior management strategies should be examined.

Dunn, R., Jaafar, S. B., Earl, L., & Katz, S. (2012). Towards data-informed decisions: From ministry policy to school practice. *Data-based Decision Making in Education,* **155-175.**

This chapter describes how the province of Ontario, Canada structured a large-scale initiative to ensure that all schools in the province had access to high-quality data and to develop a culture of inquiry, in which there is widespread capacity to work with data and where using data becomes a routine part of the operation of the educational system at all levels. Their initiative, the Managing Information for Student Achievement/Professional Network Centres (MISA/PNC), was created to support development in school districts to establish data systems and build capacity for using data. Districts and schools have to provide the government with different data through their data systems and in turn, the government provides districts and schools with funding and professional development opportunities.

Finn, J. D., & Servoss, T. J. (2012). Misbehavior, suspensions, and security measures in high school: Racial/ethnic and gender differences. Unpublished manuscript. Center for Civil Rights Remedies national conference: *Closing the School Research Gap: Research to Remedies.*

This study used merged data from three national surveys to address questions about security measures in American high schools, suspension rates, and student misbehavior. First, the study identified the characteristics of schools that implemented the most extreme security measures and those with the highest levels of discipline. Second, the study used data on individual students to examine misbehavior and race and gender disparities in suspensions not attributable to misbehavior. Black-white differences in suspensions were found, most of which were not attributable to student-reported or teacher-reported misbehavior. The differences were

greatest in larger schools and schools with high degrees of security. Students of Hispanic origin were suspended at higher rates than were non-Hispanic white students, but these differences were attributable entirely to poorer school behavior. The issue deserves continued study because of the profound educational implications of absenteeism no matter what the reason.

Losen, D.J. (2011). *Good Discipline: Legislation for Education Reform.* **Boulder, CO: National Education Policy Center. Retrieved November 26, 2012 from** http://www.greatlakescenter.org/docs/Policy_Briefs/Losen_Discipline_LB.pdf

This brief includes the following three recommendations (rooted in the research reviewed in the companion policy brief, *Discipline policies, successful schools, and racial justice)* for seeking policy change through legislation: 1) Federal and state policy should require the annual collection and reporting of a wide range of school discipline data to the public, at the school, district and state levels, disaggregated by race, ethnicity, gender, disability status, English learner status and socio-economic status; 2) Accountability systems that evaluate schools and districts should consider multiple indicators of performance, including rates of disciplinary exclusion from school and; 3) Legislation should help ensure that effective systemic approaches, such as school-wide systems of positive behavioral supports, as well as support for individual teachers to improve classroom management skills, are provided at the level of schools and districts.

McIntosh, K., Frank, J. L., & Spaulding, S. A. (2010). Establishing research-based trajectories of office discipline referrals for individual students. *School Psychology Review***,** *39***(3), 380.**

The article examined the properties of office disciplinary referrals (ODRs) as they relate to measuring individual student problem behavior in elementary schools and examined the technical adequacy of ODRs a behavioral assessment tool for individual student, data-based decision making within a problem-solving model. Using a sample of 990,908 students in 2,509 elementary schools, findings of the study indicated consistent linear mean growth trajectory in ODRs. Logistic regression analyses showed that intermediate cut points (receiving 1 ODR or 2 or more ODRs) were moderately accurate in predicting total ODRs received. The authors found that that intermediate ODR cut points yield a sharper increase at the start of the school year and hence more promise for screening. Specific problem behaviors were less predictive of total ODRs.

Scott, T. M., Hirn, R. G., & Barber, H. (2012). Affecting disproportional outcomes by ethnicity and grade level: Using discipline data to guide practice in high school. *Preventing School Failure: Alternative Education for Children and Youth***,** *56***(2), 110-120.**

This is a case study of referral system created an implemented in a Midwestern high school in order to identify disproportionate referral rates for freshmen and minority students. The article describes the process by which faculty members identified contextual predictors and agreed on simple rules, routines, and physical arrangements across the school. As a part of the continuing

move toward more systematic and proactive discipline system, the staff were guided to collect, graph, and discuss student discipline referral data, predicting failures as part of the data-based decision making. As a result, the schools began to see positive effects in terms of reduced office referrals for both of the identified overrepresented groups.

Spillane, J. (2012). Data in practice: Conceptualizing the data-based decision-making phenomena. *American Journal of Education*, *118*(2), 113-41.

This is an essay that identifies some conceptual and analytical tools for studying data in practice by drawing on work from various theoretical orientations. The author explores some ways in which we might frame a research agenda in order to investigate data in everyday practice in schools. My account is centered on schoolhouse work practice, but the research apparatus I consider can be applied to practice in other organizations in the education sector and indeed to interorganizational practice, a critical consideration in the education sector.

IMPLICIT BIAS AND CULTURAL COMPETENCE AROUND RACE, GENDER, GENDER IDENTITY AND SEXUAL ORIENTATION

1. How do we encourage schools to more directly discuss issues of race, gender, sexual orientation? What is the best strategy for encouraging schools to address issues of implicit bias and cultural responsiveness?

2. What orientation, tools or training is needed for school staff?

3. What additional research is needed to develop best practices? Who is best suited to do that?

IV.   **Implicit Bias and Cultural Competence around Race, Gender, Gender Identity, and Sexual Orientation**

Blake, J. J., Butler, B. R., Lewis, C. W., & Darensbourg, A. (2011). Unmasking the inequitable discipline experiences of urban Black girls: Implications for urban educational stakeholders. *The Urban Review*, *43*(1), 90-106.

This study explored whether discipline infractions by African American girls and the sanctions imposed disproportionately differ from all female students, from White females, and from Hispanic females. The study found that African American girls disproportionately receive exclusionary discipline. Further, the schools' stated reasons for African American girls' referrals differed from the reasons for White and Hispanic girls' referrals.

Booker, K., & Mitchell, A. (2011). Patterns in recidivism and discretionary placement in disciplinary alternative education: The impact of gender, ethnicity, age, and special education status. *Education and Treatment of Children*, *34*(2), 193-208.

This study examined the probability of (a) being placed in a disciplinary alternative education setting for mandatory versus discretionary reasons and (b) returning to placement within the same year among an ethnically diverse sample (African American, Caucasian, Hispanic) of middle and high school students (N=270). Participants were compared based on ethnicity, gender, grade level, and special education status. Students of color were significantly more likely than Caucasian students to be placed in disciplinary alternative education for discretionary reasons (i.e.truancy, drugs, gang involvement) and were more likely to return to placement within the same school year. A similar result was revealed for high school students when compared to middle school students. No differences were found for discretionary placement between boys and girls, but boys were 2.3 times more likely to be recidivists. There were found between students who qualified for special education services and those who did not.

Carter, P. (2008). Teaching students fluency in multiple cultural codes. In M. Pollock (Ed.), *Every Day Anti Racism: Getting real about race in school*. New York: New Press.

Provides an account of how a South African White high school principal and teacher perceive certain groups of students' commitments, abilities, and motivations based on their dress, speech, and other cultural expressions that diverge from middle-class white norms. Carter suggests that teachers not make judgments about the capacities of students based on non-cognitive traits, but seek to help students navigate back and forth across different cultural and stylistic codes, adapting their behaviors as the situation demands. Furthermore, educators must learn to cultivate their own multicultural navigational skills to model for students how people effectively negotiate meaning among cultures. This is accomplished by respecting multiple cultural identities, engaging in pedagogic practices that expand students' worldviews, increasing cultural capital, and instilling students with pride in their multicultural identity.

Chavous, T. M., Rivas-Drake, D., Smalls, C., Griffin, T., & Cogburn, C. (2008). Gender matters, too: The influences of school racial discrimination and racial identity on academic engagement outcomes among African American adolescents. *Developmental Psychology*, **44(3), 637.**

The authors examined relationships among racial identity, school-based racial discrimination experiences, and academic engagement outcomes for adolescent boys and girls in Grades 8 and 11 (n = 204 boys and n = 206 girls). The authors found gender differences in peer and classroom discrimination. For boys, higher racial centrality was negatively correlated with school importance attitudes and grades. Boys who experience higher racial centrality were at lower risk of experiencing classroom discrimination, described as the perception of discrimination in class settings by teachers and being disciplined more harshly, relative to boys lower in centrality.

Devine, P. G., Forscher, P. S., Austin, A. J., & Cox, W. T. L. (2012). Long-term reduction in implicit race bias: A prejudice habit-breaking intervention. *Journal of Experimental Social Psychology*, **1-12.**

This article describes a multi-faceted prejudice breaking intervention developed to reduce implicit bias long term. The article examines the impact of the intervention on the extent of implicit race bias assessed over time. The intervention is based on the premise that implicit bias functions like a habit that can be broken through a combination of awareness of implicit bias, concern about the effects of that bias, and the application of strategies to reduce bias. The effectiveness of the intervention was evaluated using a randomized, controlled design where 91 non-Black students completed a 12 week study for course credit. Results of the evaluation demonstrated that people who received the intervention showed great reductions in implicit race bias. Additionally, the intervention was found to increase both personal awareness of one's bias and a general concern about discrimination in society. Participants in the control group did not show any of the above effects.

GLSEN (2011). Teaching Respect: LGBT-Inclusive Curriculum and School Climate *(Research Brief)*. **New York: GLSEN.**

GLSEN's 2009 *National School Climate Survey* revealed that when educators include positive representations of LGBT people, history, and events in their curricula, students experienced school as a less-hostile place. Even though having an inclusive curriculum is associated with positive outcomes for LGBT students, the vast majority (86.6%) reported they were never taught anything about LGBT people, history, or events in their classes. The research brief strongly recommends including in curricula and classroom materials positive representations of LGBT people, history, and events.

Greflund, S., McIntosh, K., Mercer, S. H., & May, S. L. (2012). Examining disproportionality in school discipline practices for students with aboriginal status in Western Canada. Unpublished manuscript. Center for Civil Rights Remedies national conference: *Closing the School Research Gap: Research to Remedies*.

The purpose of the study was to investigate the extent to which Canadian students with Aboriginal status receive disproportionate levels of Office Discipline Referrals (ODRs) and more severe administrative consequences relative to students without Aboriginal status. The participants were all 1750 students in five elementary and middle schools across two school districts, in British Columbia and Alberta. Multilevel modeling and binary logistic regression were used to calculate odds ratios. Students with Aboriginal status were no more likely to receive ODRs than students without Aboriginal status. Students with Aboriginal status were more likely, but not statistically significantly more likely, to receive suspensions and harsh administrative consequences from ODRs. Implications for practice and research are discussed.

Greytak, E. A., & Kosciw, J. G. (2010). Year one evaluation of the New York City Department of Education" Respect for All" training program. *Gay, Lesbian and Straight Education Network (GLSEN)*.

 The GLSEN (Gay, Lesbian and Straight Education Network) Research Department conducted an evaluation of the New York City Department of Education's (NYC DOE) "Respect for All" two-day training program for secondary school educators to learn to support lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender, and questioning (LGBTQ) students and combat all forms of bias-based bullying and harassment. Findings from the Year One evaluation demonstrate that this training program is an effective means for developing the competency of educators to address bias-based bullying and harassment, and to create safer school environments for LGBTQ students. GLSEN surveyed 813 educators who participated in the training at three different stages. Compared to before the training, after the training educators demonstrated increased: (1) Knowledge of appropriate terms; (2) Access to LGBTQ-related resources; (3) Awareness of how their own practices might have been harmful to LGBTQ students; (4) Empathy for LGBTQ students; (5) Belief in the importance of intervening in anti-LGBTQ remarks; (6) Communication with students and staff about LGBTQ issues; (7) Engagement in activities to create safer schools for LGBTQ students (i.e., supporting Gay-Straight Alliances, including LGBTQ content in curriculum); and (8) Frequency of intervention in anti-LGBTQ name-calling, bullying, and harassment.

Morris, E. W. (2007). "Ladies" or "loudies"? Perceptions and experiences of black girls in classrooms. *Youth & Society*, *38*(4), 490-515.

The focus of this study is on African American girls who performed well academically in a predominately minority school. The author noted that the teachers questioned the girls' manners and behavior and tried to mold them into "ladies." Race and class was theorized as

shaping the teachers' perceptions of femininity and encouraging traditional femininity was described as limiting African American girls' academic potential.

Pollock, M. (2008). Talking precisely about equal opportunity. In M. Pollock (Ed.), *Every Day Anti Racism: Getting real about race in school***. New York: The New Press.**

Offers three suggestions to educators for talking more precisely about which acts help equalize opportunity for students of color and what offering equal opportunity in the school actually entails. The first suggetion is that educators discern which everyday acts move specific students or student populations toward educational opporunties and which acts move students father away from it. The second suggestion is the need to identify and address the needs of specific subpopulations in their schools. The third suggestion requests educators to color their "colormuteness" by talking precisely about the causes of racial disparities, as well as discussing opportunities students would need if disparities are eliminated.

Singleton, G.E., & Linton, C. (2006). Courageous conversations about race: A field guide for achieving equity in schools. Thousand Oaks, CA: Corwin Press.

This book suggests the need for candid, courageous conversations about race so that educators may understand why performance inequity persists, and learn how they can develop a curriculum that promotes true academic equity. The authors' present a system wide plan for transforming schools and districts that includes 1) Implementation exercises 2) Prompts, language, and tools that support profound discussion 3) Activities and checklists for administrators and 4) Action steps for creating an equity team.

Steinberg, M.P., Allensworth, E., & Johnson, D.W. (2012). What conditions jeopardize and support safety in urban schools? The influence of community characteristics, school composition, and school organizational practices on student and teacher reports of safety in Chicago. Unpublished manuscript. Center for Civil Rights Remedies national conference: *Closing the School Research Gap: Research to Remedies***.**

School safety is a pressing issue in urban schools. Yet, there is little research that shows why schools vary in safety and whether school practices mediate the influence of neighborhood characteristics. Using a unique dataset on Chicago Public Schools, this study examines the internal and external conditions associated with students' and teachers' reports of safety, showing that factors under the school's control – their social and organizational structure – mediate the external influences of crime, poverty, and human resources in students' residential communities. In particular, the quality of relationships between school staff, students and parents define safe schools in Chicago. In contrast, frequent use of suspensions is associated with less safe environments, even when comparing schools serving students with similar backgrounds.

Vincent, C. G., Pavel, M., Sprague, J. R., & Tobin, T. J. (2012). Towards identifying schol-level factors reducing disciplinary exclusions of American Indian/Alaska Native students. Unpublished manuscript. Center for Civil Rights Remedies national conference: *Closing the School Research Gap: Research to Remedies.*

This study examined the relationship between the recommendations of the Native American community for improving outcomes for American Indian/Alaska Native (AI/AN) students and school level practices. The researchers merged data from the 2009 National Indian Education Study (NIES) with data reflecting disciplinary exclusions in Oregon. The unweighted sample consisted of 40 elementary schools, 40 middle schools, <10 high schools, and 10 K-8/12 schools. Results indicated that teachers made little use of the recommended practices. The majority of teacher did not make frequent use of Native culture and history in delivering the academic curriculum, nor did they participate in professional development opportunities to learn about strategies to improve outcomes for AI/AN students. Linear regression outcomes indicated no statistically significant association between teacher practices and disciplinary outcomes for AI/AN students. School administrators reported high involvement of family and community members in school activities; however, no statistically significant association between this school level practice and discipline outcomes for AI/AN students was found. Recommendations for future research are provided.

SCHOOL-BASED INTERVENTIONS ADDRESSING DISPROPORTIONALITY

1. How can universal, evidence based interventions (e.g. PBIS, SEL, Restorative Justice) become more responsive to issues of disparity?

2. What are the skills that educators and juvenile justice personnel should be trained in to increase the effectiveness of their interaction with youth?

3. What do we know about school climate with respect to issues of race, gender, sexual orientation and gender identity?

4. How do we encourage research in this area?

V.   Adding Cultural Responsiveness to School-based Interventions

Cheremshynski, C., Lucyshyn, J. M., & Olson, D. L. (2012). Implementation of a culturally appropriate positive behavior support plan with a Japanese mother of a child with autism: An experimental and qualitative analysis. *Journal of Positive Behavior Interventions***, 1-12.**

The purpose of this study was to empirically investigate a family-centered approach to positive behavior support (PBS) that was designed to be culturally responsive to families of diverse linguistic and cultural backgrounds. A single-subject withdrawal design evaluated the functional relation between parent implementation of a culturally informed PBS plan and improvements in child behavior and participation in a dinner routine and qualitative case study methods guided an understanding of the family's culture, the mother's perspectives on the PBS plan and outcomes, and the interventionist's perspectives on the provision of behavior support to the family. Three themes emerged from the qualitative analysis: (a) developing a rapport informed by family culture; (b) working with a cultural guide to facilitate understanding the family's cultural values, beliefs, and parenting practices; and (c) accommodating the mother's cross-cultural values and beliefs.

Cornell, D., & Lovegrove, P. (2012). Student threat assessment as a method of reducing student suspensions. Unpublished manuscript. Center for Civil Rights Remedies national conference: *Closing the School Research Gap: Research to Remedies***.**

This paper presents two studies of the Virginia Student Threat Assessment Guidelines, which is a systematic method for schools to respond to student threats of violence without resorting to zero tolerance suspension. The first study reports secondary analyses from a randomized controlled trial which previously reported that students attending schools using the Virginia Guidelines were less likely to receive a long-term suspension (Odds Ratio = .35) than students attending control group schools using a zero tolerance approach (Cornell, Allen, & Fan, 2012). The secondary analyses found no difference in the impact on White versus Black students, which means that both racial groups benefitted from the intervention. The second study examined the scaled-up implementation of the Virginia Guidelines in Virginia public schools using a retrospective, quasi-experimental design. Schoolwide annual suspension rates were compared in 971 schools that chose to adopt the Virginia Guidelines versus 824 schools not using the Virginia Guidelines. Use of the Virginia Guidelines was associated with 19% fewer long-term suspensions and 8% fewer short-term suspensions schoolwide during the 2010-2011 school year. Length of implementation was associated with greater reductions in suspensions. Schools with formal training in the Virginia Guidelines had greater reductions than schools that adopted them without formal training.

Fallon, L. M., O'Keeffe, B. V., & Sugai, G. (2012). Consideration of culture and context in school-wide positive behavior support: A review of current literature. *Journal of Positive Behavior Interventions***, 14(4), 209-219.**

A review of the literature related to culture and student behavior reveals a number of interesting observations that are not surprising. First, culture is a difficult construct to define and has been defined variably over the years. Second, schools are becoming increasingly diverse, and evidence-based behavior management practices have been implemented with varied levels of integrity and varied outcomes. Third, students who spend more time outside the classroom because of disciplinary consequences are at increased risk for negative outcomes, such as diminished academic identity, deficient academic skills, and higher attrition. The school-wide positive behavior supports (SWPBS) framework has been implemented in numerous settings with student populations representing a variety of cultures. A literature review and concept article were developed concurrently and were found to inform each other. In this study, a review of existing literature on culturally and contextually relevant strategies for behavior management in schools was conducted. Based on this review, general recommendations are presented for practitioners, personnel preparers, policy makers, and researchers, especially, in the context of implementing SWPBS.

Fenning, P., Pigott, T., Engler, E., Bradshaw, K., Gamboney, E., Grunewald, S., et al. (2012). A mixed methods approach examining ethinic disproportionality in exclusionary discipline. Unpublished manuscript. Center for Civil Rights Remedies national conference: *Closing the School Research Gap: Research to Remedies***.**

For over four decades, ethnic disproportionality in discipline, particularly among African-American males, has been well documented. While the causes for this consistent phenomenon are largely unknown, several factors have been discounted as the primary means of explanation, such as ethnic minority students engaging in more severe offenses to warrant school discipline responses, socioeconomic status of ethnic minority students, and the statistical means by which the data are analyzed. Using a sociocultural framework with a focus on high schools, the study summarizes three-inter-related areas of research on the topic. To provide a context, literature is presented depicting content found in written discipline policies. The second study is a qualitative study involving high school key stakeholders perceptions of the use of school discipline, while the third study is a quantitative analysis of extant data in a larger study of high schools implementing Schoolwide Positive Behavior Support (SWPBS).

Gregory, A., Allen, J. P., Mikrami, A. Y., Hafen, C. A., & Pianta, R. C. (2012). The promise of a teacher professional development program in reducing disparity in classroom discipline referrals. Unpublished manuscript. Center for Civil Rights Remedies national conference: *Closing the School Research Gap: Research to Remedies***.**

There is an urgent need for rigorously tested interventions that result in lowered use of disciplinary referrals with African American students. Without evidence of effective interventions, educators, policy makers, and advocates have little guidance on how to disrupt the entrenched pattern of racial disparities in discipline. The current study drew on a randomized controlled trial of My Teaching Partner-Secondary (MTP-S). Ninety-five teachers

were randomly assigned to the professional development intervention (MTP-S) or the business-as-usual condition. Intervention teachers were paired with a coach who applied the Classroom Assessment Scoring System (CLASS-S) to the teachers' video-recorded classroom instruction. Through the dimensions of the CLASS-S, coaches helped teachers reflect on strengths and weaknesses in their interactions with their students. MTP-S aimed to improve teachers' ability to offer clear routines, fair implementation of rules, and proactive monitoring of behavior and sought to support teachers in developing warm, respectful relationships that recognized students' needs for autonomy, leadership, relevancy, and peer interactions. After the first year of the intervention, MTP-S teachers made fewer office discipline referrals in their racially and ethnically diverse classrooms compared to teachers who did not receive the program. This finding held when accounting for differences in teacher, classroom, and student characteristics.

Jones, C., Caravaca, L., Cizek, S., Horner, R.H., & Vincent, C.G. (2006). Culturally responsive school-wide positive behavior support: A case study in one school with a high proportion of Native American students. *Multiple Voices for Ethnically Diverse Exceptional Learners, 9*(1), 108-119.

This article is a case study of a New Mexico school with a predominantly Native American student population that exemplifies how lesson plans and other Schoolwide Positive Behavior Support (SWPBS) products can be enhanced by embedding students' language, values, and exemplars of expected behaviors using culturally-relevant leaders and historical figures.

Simson, D. (2012). An inquiry into restorative justice's effectiveness in schools. Unpublished manuscript. Center for Civil Rights Remedies national conference: *Closing the School Research Gap: Research to Remedies.*

This study uses publicly available school discipline data to investigate whether schools that implement Restorative Justice-based methods into their school discipline practices are able to reduce their reliance on punitive school discipline to a greater extent than comparable schools that do not implement Restorative Justice. Analyzing a dataset that includes 143 schools from two large school districts in the Mid-, and Southwest, I find that "Restorative Justice schools" are not only more successful in reducing the total number of suspensions imposed on students than "non-Restorative Justice schools," but they are also better able to reduce racial disparity in their discipline practices. Based on these findings, I recommend greater funding for Restorative Justice initiatives in schools and call for improvements in data reporting to improve the quality and quantity of inquiries similar to this study in the future.

Utley, C. A., Greenwood, C. R., & Douglas, K. (2007). The effects of a social skills strategy on disruptive and problem behaviors in African American students in an urban elementary school: A pilot study. *Multiple Voices for Ethnically Diverse Exceptional Learners, 10*(1), 173-190.

This pilot study examines the effects of the implementation of the Cool Tool, a social skills strategy, on the disruptive and problem behaviors of third-grade (n=4) and fourth-grade (n =6) African American students in an urban elementary school. Following the completion of the social skills intervention in both classrooms, the findings of pre- and post-classroom observations revealed that (a) the on-task performance and socially appropriate behaviors of African American students increased and (b) teachers increased their level of praises of students' behaviors.

Vincent, C., Sprague, J., & Gau, J. M. (2012). The effectiveness of school-wide positive behavior support for reducing racially inequitable disciplinary exclusions in middle school. Unpublished manuscript. Center for Civil Rights Remedies national conference: *Closing the School Research Gap: Research to Remedies***.**

The authors merged data on the extent to which middle schools implemented school-wide positive behavior interventions and supports (SWPBIS) with data on disciplinary exclusions occurring in those schools across a period of 3 years. The authors conducted descriptive and multivariate analyses of variance to examine if (a) SWPBIS can be implemented in middle school settings, (b) SWPBIS implementation is associated with reductions in disciplinary inequity, and (c) if changes in disciplinary inequity vary with school-wide percent of students on free and reduced lunch and percent of non-White enrollment. Analysis of fidelity data indicated that schools were able to implement the core features of SWPBIS based on training provided. Descriptive analyses showed that SWPBIS implementation appeared associated with less divergence in expulsion, in-school suspension, and out-of school suspension rates across racial/ethnic groups. Truancy rates, however, were higher for Hispanic and American Indian/Alaska Native students in implementing schools. School-level demographic factors did not appear to impact racial/ethnic inequity in schools implementing SWPBIS. Recommendations for adapting SWPBIS implementation to achieve greater disciplinary equity across racial/ethnic student groups are provided.

Wang, M., McCart, A., & Turnbull, A. P. (2007). Implementing positive behavior support with Chinese American families: Enhancing cultural competence. *Journal of Positive Behavior Interventions, 9***(1), 38-51.**

This article provides a case study of a 14-year old Chinese American girl and the ways in which professionals can embed cultural values of positive behavior supports (PBS). The article focuses on four key features as exemplars of the embedded cultural values of PBS: collaborative partnerships, functional assessment, contextual fit, and meaningful lifestyle outcomes. Implementation of embedded cultural values within a PBS framework led to improvements in Meng's problem behavior and enhanced her and her family's quality of life. The authors argue that just knowing PBS concepts is not enough. Professionals need a clear understanding of the embedded cultural values of PBS, cultural-specific knowledge about families from diverse backgrounds, and must acknowledge variation in cultural values among families.

Wearmouth, J., McKinney, R., & Glynn, T. (2007). Restorative justice: Two examples from New Zealand schools. *British Journal of Special Education, 34,* 196-203.

The authors discuss two examples of restorative justice practices in New Zealand that illustrate how community norms and values can help to encourage more socially appropriate behavior. Both examples take place within a Maori context and interventions are implemented with young men whose behavior was of concern in both the school and neighborhood. The interventions operated through traditional Maori entail a move away from a retributive justice approach in order to focus on 'putting things right' between all those involved by shifting the focus from individuals to whole communities and employing culturally appropriate mechanisms to address and resolve tension and make justice visible and more productive. The authors argue that schools must recognize the important sources of support that may be found in some families and local community groups for addressing problematic student behavior.