Annotated Bibliography

The School-to-Prison Pipeline:
Pathways from Schools to Juvenile Justice

Compiled by
Mariella Arredondo
Natasha Williams
Maureen Convery

The Equity Project at Indiana University
May 2012
Who is at risk?

Racial/Ethnic Disparities .......................................................................................................................................................... 3

Gender .................................................................................................................................................................................... 4

Socio-economic status (SES) .................................................................................................................................................... 5

Sexual Orientation and Gender Identity ............................................................................................................................... 6

Disciplinary disparities at school ............................................................................................................................................ 6

Effect on school climate on academic performance/suspension/expulsion/drop-out ......................................................... 7

Disability Status ........................................................................................................................................................................ 8

Pathways from schools to juvenile justice

Increases in zero tolerance approaches ................................................................................................................................. 9

Zero tolerance and exclusion .................................................................................................................................................. 9

Police presence, ticketing, and arrests ................................................................................................................................ 11

Effects of punitive discipline on school climate ................................................................................................................... 12

Effects of punitive discipline on school engagement/lost educational opportunity ................................................................. 14

Effects of punitive discipline on dropout/pushout .................................................................................................................. 15

Effects of punitive discipline on juvenile justice involvement and juvenile delinquency ....................................................... 16

Direct links between increases in zero tolerance and juvenile justice .................................................................................. 17

Disproportionate Minority Contact (DMC) tools .................................................................................................................... 18

This study analyzed 6,988 children in 381 classrooms at 21 elementary schools participating in a randomized trial of School-Wide Positive Behavioral Interventions and Supports (SWPBIS) to identify factors at the student and classroom levels that may contribute to the overrepresentation of African American students in office disciplinary referrals. Analyses indicated that African American students were significantly more likely than White students to receive office disciplinary referrals even after controlling for the student’s level of teacher-rated behavior problems, teacher ethnicity, and other classroom factors. Results also suggested that racial/ethnic match between students and their teachers did not reduce the risk for referrals among African American students.


Examined the relationship between school segregation and the overrepresentation of African American students among those suspended, controlling rate of school disorder (e.g., incidents of violence, weapons possession, property crimes, substance use and possession). Multivariate analyses indicated that higher levels of school segregation corresponded with lower levels of the African American suspension imbalance. Results suggest that schools situated in relatively highly segregated districts have the lowest rates of African American imbalances in suspension.


A review of national suspension rates since the early 1970s for K-12 public schools reveals a substantial increase in the use of suspension for students of all races. Data indicate that suspension rates have at least doubled for students of color (African Americans, Hispanics, Native American, and Asian/Pacific Islander) and show a less than 2% increase for White students. Moreover, this national sample of more than 9,000 middle schools showed that 28.3 percent of black males, on average, were suspended at least once during a school year, nearly three times the 10 percent rate for white males. Black females were suspended more than four times as often as white females (18 percent vs. 4 percent).


Based on disciplinary data collected in the 1996–1997 academic year in 142 schools located in one school district, it was found that 26.28% of African American male and 13.64% of African American female students were suspended at least once compared to 11.95% White male and 4.53% White female students.

Explored patterns of office disciplinary referrals in a nationally-representative sample of elementary and middle schools implementing school-wide PBS for at least one year. Racial/ethnic disparities were found in both classroom referrals and administrative consequences at both the elementary and middle school level for African American students, and for Latino students at the middle school level. Although minor infractions were less likely to receive less severe punishments in general, African American and Latino students were far more likely than white students to receive suspension and expulsion for minor infractions.


Using data from the national University of Michigan Monitoring the Future study, the study reveals that both minor and more severe disciplinary practices are used widely, but distributed unequally, in U.S. schools. The researchers found that Black, Latino and Native American students were more likely to receive out-of-school suspensions, despite few racial differences among the students committing offenses likely to lead to zero tolerance policy violations (e.g., drugs, alcohol, weapons) even after socio-demographic differences were controlled.


Using a national sample of 294 public schools, Welch and Payne (2010) drew upon the racial threat hypothesis to explain the positive association between African American enrollment and more punitive school disciplinary methods. Regardless of levels of misbehavior and delinquency, schools with a higher percentage of African American students were more likely to use higher rates of exclusionary discipline, court action and zero tolerance policies, and to use fewer mild disciplinary practices.

**Gender**


Identified factors that predict severity of offense, prosecution, incarceration, and recidivism among juvenile offenders. Both race and gender influence the severity and prosecution of the youth offenders. White females were more likely to be referred for status offenses and tended to be over prosecuted relative to African Americans, while African American males who were first time offenders were more likely to be referred for more serious offenses relative to Whites.
Race and gender were found to influence juvenile justice case outcomes. Non-White males were treated more harshly than White males, but non-White females were treated either no differently or more leniently than White females.


Discriminant analysis describing gender differences in office referrals revealed that boys were more likely than girls to be referred to the office for misbehaviors ranging from minor offenses and throwing objects, to fighting and threats, to sexual offenses. Of the 32 possible reasons for referral, truancy was the only referral in which girls were more likely to be disciplined than boys.


Using data from the national University of Michigan Monitoring the Future study, Wallace et al. found that, although males of all racial and ethnic groups were more likely to be disciplined, disparities between Black and White students were greater among female students.

**SOCIOECONOMIC STATUS**


Qualitative interviews of adolescent students from both high- and low-income residential areas concerning their reactions to school discipline revealed that both low- and high-income adolescents agreed that low-income students were more likely to be unfairly targeted by school disciplinary sanctions. Low-income students reported receiving more severe consequences as compared to high-income students who more often reported receiving mild and moderate consequences.


Examined school characteristics and outcome data related to suspension rates in 161 Kentucky middle schools to identify differences between schools reporting low versus high rates of suspension. The second stage of the study compared differences between samples of 20 schools with highest rates of suspensions and 20 schools with low rates of suspensions. Results suggest that middle schools with higher rates of students from low SES were associated with high rates of suspensions.

In a multivariate analysis of variables contributing to suspension across a single state, economic disadvantage was reported to be a significant predictor of a school’s rate of suspension, but not of disproportionality in suspension.


In a multivariate analysis examining national survey data of the predictors of out-of-school suspension, Wu et al. (1982), found that school characteristics and non-behavioral student characteristics (e.g., sex, race, SES) made a more significant contribution to predicting school suspension than student behavior and attitude. Students who received free lunches at school were more likely to have been suspended.

**SEXUAL ORIENTATION AND GENDER IDENTITY**

**DISPARITIES IN EDUCATION AND JUVENILE JUSTICE**


This national longitudinal study found that non-heterosexual youth experience higher rates of educational and criminal-justice punishments such as school expulsions, arrests, and adult convictions that are disproportionate to their rates of illegal or transgressive behaviors. In addition, the study found that youth who identify as LGBT were approximately 50% more likely to be stopped by the police than other youth. Girls who identified as lesbian or bisexual showed the highest level of disparity. It was reported that non-heterosexual girls experienced about twice as many arrests and convictions as other girls who had engaged in similar transgressions.


This report, based on information collected from 414 surveys, 65 interviews with juvenile justice professionals, focus groups, and interviews of 55 youth, illustrates the disparities in sentencing, treatment, and support services LGBT youth face in the juvenile justice system compared to their heterosexual peers. The report also found evidence of systemic misconceptions and biases against LGBT youth from justice professionals.

This report of LGBT youth experiences in the New York juvenile justice system exposes systemic “discrimination and bias” against LGBT youth in the juvenile justice system. In addition to lacking a general awareness of, and sensitivity to, LGBT issues, the report also found a severe lack of services, protection, and appropriate sentencing options for this population.

**EFFECT OF SCHOOL CLIMATE ON ACADEMIC PERFORMANCE/SUSPENSION/EXPULSION/DROP-OUT**


Transgender youth face extremely high levels of victimization in school, even more so than their non-transgender lesbian, gay and bisexual peers. Transgender students regularly experience the use of biased language by peers and teachers, harassment and assault, low feelings of safety, and few services and support by school officials. This hostile climate has led to severely low rates of school involvement and poor educational outcomes including attendance, lower academic performance, and lower educational aspirations.


This nationally representative sample of 3450 youth and 1011 secondary school teachers demonstrated that LGBT youth experienced high rates of harassment, bullying, and other acts of aggression by their peers because of their appearance or presumed sexuality. LGBT students are 3 times as likely as non-LGBT students to not feel safe at school (22% vs.7%). Ninety percent of LGBT teens (vs. 62% of non-LGBT teens) have been verbally or physically harassed or assaulted during the past year because of their perceived or actual appearance, gender, sexual orientation, gender expression, race/ethnicity, disability or religion. Students’ whose schools have a policy that includes sexual orientation or gender identities are less likely than other students to report a serious harassment problem at their school.


This 2009 national survey examined the rates of school environmental variables such as feelings of safety, use of biased language by peers and faculty, and harassment/assault of LGBT students. Hostile educational environments have led to higher rates of absenteeism, lowered educational aspirations and academic achievement, and poorer psychological well-being in the LGBT youth population. Schools were able to decrease disparities through implementing educational programs and support organizations.

This study examined the association between LGBT school victimization and young adult depression, suicidal ideation, life satisfaction, self-esteem, and social integration. Lesbian, gay, bisexual, and transgender-related school victimization is strongly linked to poor young adult mental health outcomes while controlling for background characteristics.


Reviews the disciplinary data from 500 districts in California. Data shows high levels of risk for suspension and severe differences between groups of different race, gender, and disability status. Students with disabilities experienced the greatest risk for suspension. One in seven students with disabilities (13.4%) received an out-of-school suspension statewide compared with 1 in 16 students without disabilities (6.4%). This disparity can be seen across all racial groups where students with disabilities were more likely to have been suspended out-of-school than those without.


Analyses of data from longitudinal study of 8,268 students from kindergarten to grade 12 revealed that African American males enrolled in special education and receiving free or reduced lunch were overrepresented in suspension and expulsions during grade 6. Results suggest that the use of suspension in earlier years (elementary and middle school) predicts future suspensions and contributes to poor academic performance.


An analysis of out-of-school suspensions in the Hillsborough County Public Schools examining the life histories of twenty-five students with multiple suspensions in one year showed that 48 percent of those students were evaluated for special education services at some point during their schooling, with the majority of evaluations occurring at the elementary school level.


This policy brief describes trends in discipline for students with disabilities in Indiana. Statewide incident rates of out-of-school suspension for general and special education students during the 2004-2005 school year indicated that students with disabilities were suspended out of school more than twice as often as
the general education population. Race and disability status interacted: In some school districts, African American students with disabilities were 10 times more likely to be suspended than their peers.

INCREASES IN ZERO TOLERANCE APPROACHES

ZERO TOLERANCE AND EXCLUSION


A thorough overview of zero-tolerance school discipline practices and other education reforms such as No-Child-Left-Behind (NCLB) that have made school discipline practices even more punitive and lessened positive education outcomes such as graduation rates in schools across the country. These policies and practices appear to disproportionately affect Black and Latino students. From 2002-03 to 2006-07, the number of expulsions per Black student increased 33%, and expulsions per Latino student increased by 6%, while the number of expulsions per White student decreased by 2%.


Florida’s zero tolerance policy was amended in 2009 with the passage of SB 1540 following harsh critiques from researchers and education professionals. SB 1540 limits the use of police interventions and other harsh punishments for school behavior. This report examines the effects of SB 1540 on disciplinary procedures. Analysis confirms that almost half of all Florida school districts had more or the same number of school referrals to the juvenile justice system as before the passage of SB 1540.


An extensive review of the literature found that, despite a 20-year history of implementation, data tends to contradict the effectiveness of a zero tolerance approach to school discipline. Moreover, zero tolerance policies may negatively affect the relationship of education with juvenile justice.


Focuses on public school disciplinary data for the 2008-09 school year in the state of Oregon, disaggregated by race and ethnicity and includes data on suspensions, expulsions, referrals to alternative
education settings, and dropout rates. The report confirms that the disproportionate representation of youth of color is reflected in data for the juvenile and adult corrections systems.


Reviews the current state of school discipline research, including evaluations of the school-to-prison pipeline and rates of racial disparities, and highlights programs that have shown promise of substantial reform.


Examines the findings from public hearings of six Florida school districts in 2005. The purpose of the hearings was to gain a better understanding of the schools disciplinary practices, raise public awareness about the increased use of punitive disciplinary practices, expose the connections between disparities in educational opportunities and extreme discipline policies, and encourage efforts toward disciplinary reform. Among the findings were data indicating a severe racial disproportionality in discipline practice. During the 2004-05 school year, African American students represented 63% of such incidents, but only 36 percent of the total student population.


The authors analyze current state of the law for each entry point on the school to prison pipeline. An emergent area in the pipeline presented is automatic exclusion for out-of-school arrests, alternative schools and policing of K-12 public school. Moreover, the number of children arrested or referred to court for school disciplinary issues has also been identified as an area in the pipeline and the increase of policing in public schools by SROS as one of the reasons for such increase.


Reviewed data on status and serious offenses in the state of Kentucky. The overwhelming majority of referrals from schools to juvenile court were found to be for status offenses such as truancy and being “beyond the reasonable control of the school.” The report raises concerns that, without clear definition, such referrals could be applied to almost any type of disruptive or non-compliant behavior.


A zero-tolerance approach to school code violations has led to a near doubling of the number of students suspended annually from school since 1974, an increase in the presence of police in schools, and the enactment of new laws mandating referral of children to law enforcement authorities.
POLICE PRESENCE, TICKETING, AND ARRESTS


Examines the emergence of zero tolerance school discipline policies in the US school system and how these policies in addition to increase presence of police officers in schools have led to the creation of the school to prison pipeline. Data illustrate how Black and Latino students are more likely than their White counterparts to be arrested in school, regardless of the school’s racial composition. This report gives a detailed account of the pipeline in three specific school districts; Chicago, Illinois; Denver, Colorado; and Palm Beach, Florida. Youth are found at risk of falling into the school-to-prison pipeline through systematic suspensions, expulsions, discouragement, and high-stakes testing.


Reviews results from a multi-year investigation into the enforcement of daytime curfew ordinances in the city of Los Angeles and its impact on youth and families. More than 2000 youth were interviewed by organizers, students, and parent leaders working with the Community Rights Campaign. Results indicate “little evidence” that curfew laws and ticketing reduce crime, but instead place a disproportionate economic burden on low-income families, and undermine student engagement.


The study examined student disciplinary data on 22 of the largest school districts in the state of Texas. Most districts have increased the number of campus police officers - resulting in far more misdemeanor tickets being handed out to students. Ticketing of students in Texas public schools increased substantially over the two- to five-year period when the study was conducted. African American, Hispanic, and special education students were found to be disproportionately represented in Class C misdemeanor ticketing on Texas public school campuses.


In this report, researchers relied on arrest data from the Chicago Police Department (CPD) to highlight the type of offenses and the demographics (gender, age and race) of the juveniles arrested on Chicago Public Schools properties in calendar year 2010. The report reveals of the 27,000 juveniles arrested in Chicago in 2010, a fifth of them were taken into custody at school. More than two-thirds of those arrested were African American and 75 percent were male.

This report reviews the growing use of Student Resource Officers (SRO’s) in public schools and the implications of this practice on school safety, discipline policies, referrals to the juvenile justice system, and disproportionality of discipline procedures for minority students. Reviewing data from several national studies, this report reveals how a growing use of SRO’s has led to an increase in juvenile justice referrals due to a reliance on arrests as a form of school discipline.


In 2009, approximately 68% of students that responded to the *National Crime Victimization Survey* reported the presence of security guards and/or assigned police officers, as compared to 1999 figures showing that 54% of students reported the presence of security guards and/or assigned police officers.


Data compiled from the Bureau of Justice Statistics show that in 1997 there were 9,446 School Resource Officers (SROs) in local police departments assigned to public schools in the U.S., compared to increasing number of 13,056 full time School Resource Officers in 2007. Current figures point well over 17,000 SROs nationwide.

### EFFECTS OF PUNITIVE DISCIPLINE ON SCHOOL CLIMATE


This study of school crime across national sample of 712 high schools found that the effect of serious penalties, including removal without services, out-of school suspensions, and outright expulsion, yielded higher numbers of incidents of school crime, even after controlling for community, student population, and school climate variables.


Examined the relationship between structure and support in the high school climate and suspension rates in 199 schools. Multivariate analyses showed that schools low on characteristics of an authoritative school (both structure and support) had the highest school-wide suspension rates for all students, as well as the largest racial discipline gaps, after statistically controlling for school demographics.

Examined authoritative discipline practices and adolescents’ safety in school from a statewide sample of over from 290 high schools. Hierarchical linear modeling results indicate that consistent enforcement of school discipline and supportive adults to be associated with school safety. Structure and support were associated with less bullying and victimization after controlling for size of school enrollment and the proportion of ethnic minority and low-income students.


Using a study sample drawn from the 1997 Student Survey of the Chicago Public Schools (CPS), this study explored the role of social bonds between students and teachers as a mechanism of social control. Results indicated that students were less likely to be suspended in schools characterized by high levels of trust and respect among teachers, and shared expectations among teachers for maintaining school rules.


Compared self-reported rates of detention and suspension with ratings of racial school climate in a study of 1,838 White and African American high school students. African American students reported more experiences of racism and lower ratings of racial fairness at school, and both of these ratings were associated with higher rates of detentions and suspensions.


A survey of students and teachers in Chicago Public Schools revealed that schools with harsh discipline policies and higher rates of suspensions are perceived as less safe by students and teachers. Schools serving a higher proportion of African American students were perceived as less safe by students.


Conducted a study to examine the link between school climate and development of problem behaviors using a three-wave longitudinal data set comprised of sixth grade student’s perceptions of school climate and found that students who perceive a more positive school climate in sixth grade had a lower probability of experiencing problem behaviors in seventh and eighth grade. They conclude that adolescents’ perception of school climate is a strong predictor of problem behavior.

This study found that the New York City Impact Schools program, which included increased police presence and stricter disciplinary enforcement, resulted in worsening attendance, suspensions, and noncriminal police incidents as compared to a matched sample of New York schools. Additionally, student academic success, measured by the percentage of students taking the Scholastic Aptitude Test (SAT) tests, decreased in relationship to previous years from a mean value of 33.59 in 2002-2003 compared to 29.97 in 2004-2005.


Using a multivariate model predicting achievement for African American males, the researchers found that a school’s emphasis on discipline and the number of suspensions a student received negatively predicted achievement in 8th grade, and negatively predicted school engagement in 10th grade.


Authors used a sample of just over 3,500 African American males from a Midwestern urban school district to study the discipline patterns of African American males and school district responses that impact their academic achievement on state standardized tests. Results indicate that African Americans received harsher punishments than their White counterparts for similar acts of disobedience, thus being suspended at higher rates and missing more school days and learning opportunities. Standardized test results reveal that just less than half of African American males did not perform at proficient/advanced level of reading.


Using data from the ADD Health national survey of 7th through 12th graders, school connectedness was found to be lower in schools that expel students for relative minor infractions, related to possessing alcohol and destruction of property, or permanently expelling students for the first occurrence of an infraction. Additionally, students reported feeling less safe in schools that use harsh punishments due to policy regulations than students in schools that use more moderate forms of punishments.

In a descriptive study examining how reforms carried out by schools affect the achievement and social development of students, Noguera (2003) found that in schools with higher rates of suspensions, the priority of the administrators was maintaining order through discipline and rigid enforcement of rules and regulations. Conversely, schools with lower rates of suspensions showed considerable evidence that students were being challenged by rigorous courses and were supported by caring teachers. Schools justify using exclusionary discipline by arguing that such practices are necessary to maintain an orderly learning environment for others.


This study found that higher school rates of out-of-school suspension were associated with lower school-wide passing rates on the state accountability test, regardless of the demographic, economic, or racial makeup of the school.

**EFFECTS OF PUNITIVE DISCIPLINE ON DROP-OUT AND PUSH-OUT**


Following the educational paths of over 400 individuals incarcerated in ninth grade in a major northeastern city, this study found that two-thirds of the ninth graders who went to prison had previously been suspended at least once in eighth grade. School suspension has been found to be a moderate-to-strong predictor of school dropout.


This ethnographic study examines routine disciplinary procedures of an inner city high school. Policies and procedures encourage disciplinarians to use suspensions, transfers, and involuntary “drops” to get rid of students deemed troublemakers. The indicators disciplinarians used to identify troublemakers are the same factors that research has stated places students at risk for dropping out.


This article provides a new three-outcome model for studying school drop-out: in school, pushed out or pulled out. Black students are more likely to be either pushed or pulled out as compared to white students, but Latino students have the highest likelihood of being pulled out when compared to their peers.

This longitudinal study of seventh graders in the state of Texas found suspension to be a strong predictor of dropout. Suspended/expelled students were 5 times as likely to drop out, compared to students with no disciplinary action.


An examination of data from the National Educational Study of 1988 indicated that students drop out of school as a result of disciplinary sanctions. Males and African Americans were more likely than females or student of other races to leave school for disciplinary reasons. Yet, African American females were more likely than other females to report suspension and expulsions as a reason for dropping out.


This study analyzed data from the National Longitudinal Survey of Youth (NLSY97) to determine the most significant characteristics of high school dropouts. Using multiple logistic regressions, the authors found that being suspended at least once increased the likelihood of dropping out of school by nearly 77.5%. Data show suspensions to be a stronger predictor of dropping out than GPA and SES.


Using data from the North Carolina Education Research Data Center at Duke University, the authors examined grade, age, ethnicity, and gender as reasons for drop-out. Results suggest ninth graders and students age 16 and younger are more likely to drop out of high school for disciplinary reasons. Males and African Americans were more likely than females or other racial ethnic groups to leave school for disciplinary reasons.


A study comparing predictors of in-school and out-of school delinquency based on data collected from 2,011 participants at four schooling institutions in a rural school district in the Appalachian region of the U.S. revealed that attachment was the best predictors of in and out of school delinquency.

Multivariate analyses examining school suspensions and arrests on subsequent adolescent antisocial behavior indicated that school suspension increased the risk of antisocial behavior a year later, after controlling for individual, family, peer, school and community level influences.


A meta-analysis of studies analyzing risk and protective factors and the development of serious and violent juvenile offending results suggest that low commitment or bonding to schooling at ages 14 and 16 predicted a significantly increased risk for involvement in violence at age 18.


In a three year study of 13 schools with an SRO and 15 schools without in a Southeastern school district with both urban and suburban characteristics, Theriot evaluated the impact of SROs on school-based arrest rates by comparing arrest at the thirteen schools with an SRO to the fifteen schools without and SRO in the same district. Schools that had SROs had nearly five times the number of arrests for disorderly conduct as schools without an SRO even when controlling for the school’s level of economic disadvantage. Students at schools with greater economic disadvantage had a higher number of total arrests as well as more arrests for assault, weapons possession, disorderly conduct, and other charges than schools with less poverty. However, when controlling for school poverty, schools with an SRO had fewer arrests for weapons and assault charges.

**DIRECT LINK BETWEEN INCREASES IN ZERO TOLERANCE AND JUVENILE JUSTICE**


This longitudinal study sought to assess linkages between discipline and delinquency in order to determine how many of the nearly one million students tracked for this study had contact with the juvenile justice system between seventh and twelfth grade. The study followed every seventh grader in the state of Texas through their high school years. Even after controlling for more than 80 individual and school-level variables, multivariate analyses indicated that suspended or expelled students had a greater likelihood of contact with the juvenile justice system in subsequent years; the relationship was even stronger for African American students. A bivariate analysis showed that 23% of students involved in school disciplinary system became involved in the juvenile justice system compared to 2% of students who had no involvement in the disciplinary school system.

Examined school discipline and juvenile justice data for African-American and White youth aged 10-17 in 53 counties in Missouri, and found that racial disproportionality in out-of-school suspensions proved to be a strong predictor of similar levels of racial disparity in juvenile court referrals, even when controlling for levels of delinquent behavior, poverty, and other demographic variables.


Examination of a national database of discipline, juvenile justice, and achievement data to explore the relationship between the use of school suspension and outcome variables in the areas of school achievement and incarceration revealed that states with higher rates of school suspension were also more likely to have higher rates of juvenile incarceration. States with higher rates of African American disproportionality in school suspension also had higher rates of disproportionality in juvenile justice incarceration.

**DISPROPORTIONATE MINORITY CONTACT (DMC) TOOLS**


The “Racial and Ethnic Disparities Juvenile Justice Data Map” provides state-by-state annual data disaggregated by race, ethnicity, and offense type for each state. The map also contains annual information of the rate of involvement of minors in the juvenile justice system by decision.


The OJJDP Statistical Briefing Book (SBB) enables users to access information to learn more about juvenile crime and victimization and about youth involved in the juvenile justice system. The data analysis and dissemination tools available through SBB give access to detailed statistics on a variety of juvenile justice topics. The DMC Databook enables users to review the processing of delinquency cases within the juvenile justice system and assess levels of disproportionate minority contact at various decision points.