Research Manuscript Critique Form

Introduction
1. What are the researchers trying to find out (i.e., What is their research question or hypothesis)?
2. Why bother to conduct this study? What benefits do the researchers cite?
3. What are the theoretical constructs they mention? How well are these constructs related to empirical research?

Method — Subjects
4. Who are the subjects? How many? How were they selected? Can these data be generalized?

Method — Procedures
5. How were the data collected? Are the data quantified? What are (independent/selected/predictor/input) variables? What are the (dependent/criterion/predicted/outcome) variables?

Method — Instruments
6. Do you consider the measures reliable and valid (trustworthy)?

Method — Design
7. Have the authors used a design that enables them to rule out alternative explanations?
8. How strong is the case for causal inference?

Results / Data Analysis
9. How were the data analyzed?

Discussion
10. Do the researchers consider seriously alternative hypotheses? Do they acknowledge problems in the study? Do they mention limitations? Are they aware of implicit assumptions?

Your Judgment
11. Is sufficient procedural information provided to enable replication of this study?
12. Are the participants described in sufficient detail that we are justified in generalizing the results to the population?
13. Are the tasks/manipulation/techniques/materials described sufficiently to permit generalization to other settings?
14. Do you believe their conclusions? Is your decision based on the empirical evidence or on your own intuition?
15. Do you see any critical flaws in the study? Can you suggest improvements in design?
16. Did we find out anything from this study that we didn’t already know? Was the study worth doing?